

## SPECIALTY ADVISORY COMMITTEE IN PLASTIC SURGERY

Confirmed minutes of the meeting held on Thursday 6 June 2013 at The Royal College of Surgeons of England

### Members present:

Mr A Fitzgerald	Chair
Mr N Bennett	
Mr T Burge	
Mr M Dalal	
Mr I Mackay	
Mr A Mosahebi	
Mr B Philp	
Mr J Pollock	
Mr B Powell	
Mr A Ray	
Mr S Southern	
Mr S Wood	

### In attendance:

Ms N Aro	Specialty Manager
Ms H Lewis	QA Manager
Ms S Nicholas	Head of JCST
Ms J Woodman	Specialty Assistant

#### **16. Welcome and apologies for absence**

Mr Fitzgerald welcomed members to the meeting including Mr Nicholas Bennett as the new Armed Forces representative and Mr Stephen Southern as the new Simulation Lead.

Apologies were received from Mr S Carroll, Mr H Giele, Mr A Grobbelaar, Mr K Hancock, Mr U Khan, Dr S MacLeod, Mr D Orr and Mr R Price.

#### **17. Membership and Programme Directors**

The lists of SAC Members, Liaison Members and Programme Directors were received for information.

It was agreed that Mr Southern would take up liaison responsibilities for the East of England; Mr Bennett will take up liaison responsibilities for Scotland; and Mr Orr will take up liaison responsibilities for the South Western.

**Action: Miss Aro to update membership list.**

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald to contact individual SAC members of the importance and responsibility of attendance.**

**17.1** The Committee noted the appointment of Mr David Orr as the new SAC representative for Ireland.

**17.2** The Committee noted the appointment of Mr Southern as the new Simulation Lead for Plastic Surgery.

**17.3** Mr Fitzgerald noted that Mr Carroll had completed his term on the SAC and will send him a letter of thanks for his work.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald**

- 17.4 Mr Fitzgerald noted that Mr Grobbelaar had completed his term on the SAC and will send him a letter of thanks for his work.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald**

**18. Minutes**

The minutes of the meeting held on 24 January 2013 were agreed.

**19. Matters arising from the minutes of previous meetings not discussed elsewhere on the agenda**

There were no matters arising to be discussed.

**20. Matters for SAC Consideration**

**20.1 Curriculum Development Group**

Mr Fitzgerald reported on the Curriculum Development Group. The recent submission of the intermediate years section of the curriculum had been accepted by the GMC with only minor changes to be made. Mr Powell confirmed that there would be no change to the standard of the exam.

Mr Mosahebi has now taken over from Miss Vivien Lees as the Curriculum Lead and it was agreed that in the medium term a period of stability was needed with no further changes.

- 20.1.1 The Committee received the GMC's decision letter on the Plastic Surgery curriculum.

**20.2 GMC's Recommendation on Simulation**

The Committee received the GMC's recommendation on simulation. Mr Fitzgerald reported that the GMC had refused to accept the submission on simulation across surgery because there were concerns that there would be insufficient funding for it.

Further development within simulation will be suspended until the GMC give their final decision on it but it was agreed that Mr Southern will obtain an overview on simulation in plastic surgery to date.

**Action: Ms Maria Bussey to send simulation submission to Mr Fitzgerald, Mr Southern and Mr Mosahebi who will then discuss and find a suitable way forward.**

**20.3 National Selection**

Mr Fitzgerald reported on national selection. There were 31 national training posts available and 148 applications were received; 91 candidates were interviewed for the posts and 61 candidates following their interviews were appointable. Mr Fitzgerald explained that there had been difficulty in the past with job offers being accepted in good time so candidates were encouraged to make their decision as soon as possible and as a result the 31 successful candidates accepted and offers went out on the same day.

There was some concern with the self-scoring shortlisting process which has resulted in some of the more honest candidates not getting through. Mr Pollock added that the final scores from the portfolio station were in some cases vastly different to the candidates' self scoring. The Committee discussed methods to overcome this problem and Mr Ray suggested that the portfolio assessment should be separated from the process and be looked after by a trained group of assessors. Mr Fitzgerald believed that this would be a good idea but this will be discussed further outside of this meeting and will send the conclusion to the Committee.

It was noted that Mr Wood would take over from Mr Burge as the lead in National Selection.

- 20.3.1** Mr Fitzgerald informed the Committee of a military trainee who was not shortlisted for interview during national selection. The Defence deanery were unhappy about this but as the trainee did not score above the cut off mark this trainee did not get through. Mr Fitzgerald noted that military trainees should be seen as equivalent to their civilian counter parts and as they are also expected to gain military and surgical competencies they should demonstrate this from early on. Mr Bennett agreed that this trainee should not have been shortlisted and the trainee was withdrawn.

Mr Fitzgerald added that there needed to be improved communication links between the SAC and the Military and it was hopeful that the inclusion of Mr Bennett on the Committee would resolve this. Mr Fitzgerald added that a high number of military trainees did very well in the process and overshadowed trainees from Wessex, Oxford and Mersey.

**20.4 Academic Trainee Report**

The Committee received the Academic Trainee Report from Mr Mosahebi. Mr Fitzgerald reported that there were continued problems across the regions with academic trainees having the same length of training as full time clinical trainees. Mr Mosahebi noted that the NIHR believed this was possible but it was only likely to be possible in medical specialties. Mr Philp added that up until recently the academic trainees within his region had undertaken full clinical work and did their research out of hours, however this had recently changed and had potential to become problematic.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald to report to JCST on the ongoing concerns with ACFs/ACLs equivalence.**

**20.5 Report from the Core Training SAC**

Mr Milind gave the Committee a report on core surgical training. He reported that the Core SAC continued to have concern over the success of core surgical trainees in plastic surgery into ST3 posts; he will report back that the SAC are taking action to resolve this issue.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald to invite Dr Alison Carr to the next SAC meeting.**

**Action: Mr Philp to write to Mr Fitzgerald on the issue of core trainees doing on-call work.**

**20.6 Keogh Report into Cosmetic Surgery Regulation**

The Committee received the Keogh report of Cosmetic Surgery Regulation. A number of recommendations have been made, which include the formation a post-CCT interface group who will be in a position to monitor trainees doing two further years of training before being able to take up private practice.

Mr Mark Henley has set up a scheme in the East Midlands where the NHS cover the indemnity costs of his private practice and the DoH are keen on extending this; Mr Henley and Mr Fitzgerald will select the eligible consultants to join the scheme and Mr Fitzgerald confirmed that SAC Members, TPDs and examiners will have first access.

**Action: SAC Members to let Mr Fitzgerald know if they would like to be included in this scheme.**

**21. Liaison Member Reports**

**21.2 PLASTA Report**

Mr Pollock gave the Committee a report on the main issues from PLASTA.

He informed the Committee that the trainee regional representatives were now set up and Mr Fitzgerald confirmed that he will now involve them in disseminating information and for requesting feedback from their region.

It was reported that there was some unhappiness amongst trainees across regions who were unable to undertake out of programme experience (OOPE). Mr Fitzgerald confirmed that trainees are allowed on OOPE at the discretion of their individual deaneries but he would be happy to write a letter of support as SAC Chair to all TPDs. It was noted that the final decision on the OOPE will be made locally.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald.**

## **22. Joint Committee on Surgical Training**

The Committee received the minutes of the meeting held on 11 January 2013 and 9 April 2013 and Ms Nicholas reported on the important points from the last meeting.

It was noted that the JCST trainee fee would increase again and the trainee bodies were unhappy at this. Mr Pollock confirmed that trainees feel that the ISCP is not only a benefit to them but to trainers too and it may be sensible for the costs to be spread.

Mr Fitzgerald noted that there had been some difficulty in recruiting female Plastic surgeons onto the Committee and asked for SAC members to write to him with recommendations of any female colleagues who may be interested.

**Action: SAC Members.**

## **23. Training Interface Groups**

### **23.1 Oncoplastic Breast Surgery**

The Committee discussed the recent problems that had arisen in the Breast TIG recruitment. There were 9 posts available and all 9 posts were given to general surgical trainees and the plastic surgery team were displeased. Mr Fitzgerald had since checked the results and had received confirmation that the plastic surgical trainees were not at a good level. Mr Mackay added that he did not believe that the plastics trainees interviewed well but it was noted that their portfolios were not scored.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald to write to Ms Anne Tansley and request for some consideration to be taken on the trainee's portfolios.**

### **23.2 Hand Surgery**

The Committee received the minutes of the meeting held on 12 April 2013. Mr Fitzgerald invited Mr Southern to take over from Mr Carroll on the group and Mr Southern accepted.

**Action: Miss Aro to forward Mr Southern's details to the Hand TIG secretariat.**

### **23.3 Head and Neck Surgical Oncology**

The Committee received the minutes of the meeting held on 15 March 2013.

Mr Fitzgerald reported that there were 7 posts available and a plastic surgical trainee was ranked highest for the first time.

Mr Fitzgerald noted that he would invite Mr Mani Ragbir to replace Mr Wood in this group.

23.4 **Reconstructive Cosmetic Surgery**

The Committee received the minutes of the meeting held on 26 February 2013 and noted the potential increase in posts following the Keogh Report.

23.5 **Cleft, Lip and Palate Surgery**

Mr Ray reported that interviews were recently held and an OMFS trainee was successfully appointed. The plastics trainee who applied was at a junior level and was therefore unsuccessful.

Mr Fitzgerald queried the number of required plastic surgery members on the TIG and asked Miss Aro to confirm this. He added that he will invite Mr Michael Cadier from Salisbury to take over from Mr Goodacre.

**Action: Miss Aro.**

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald.**

24. **Quality Assurance**

24.1 **Penultimate Year Assessment Checklist**

Ms Lewis asked whether the SAC would like to compile a penultimate year assessment (PYA) checklist to be uploaded onto the ISCP. The checklist would be available for trainees, TPDs and Liaison Members to refer to during the PYA interview for ST7 trainees. The committee agreed that a checklist would be useful to assess trainees' progress towards achieving the CCT guidelines in order for any remedial action could be taken in their final year of training. Mr Fitzgerald agreed to develop a checklist.

A discussion followed regarding the problems trainees faced with coding procedures in the e-logbook and the differences between the old and new coding systems. Mr Ray suggested that the SAC should bear the coding problems in mind when assessing trainees' consolidated logbook reports.

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald to develop the PYA checklist**

24.2 **Potential Visit to the Republic of Ireland**

Mr Fitzgerald confirmed that the RCSI would like to the SAC to visit the training units in Galway, Cork and Dublin and he had decided to wait until later in the year after the new TPD was in post. Mr Burge suggested trying to organise the visit to fit in with the BAPRAS meeting in November 2013.

In response to a question from Ms Lewis, Mr Fitzgerald agreed that the reports of the specialty-specific questions in the GMC survey should be released into the public domain and the rest of the committee concurred.

25. **Recommendations for the award of CCT/CSD**

Recommendations for the award of CCT made since the last meeting were noted.

26. **Enrolment**

The following trainees were enrolled.

28. **Chair's correspondence**

28.1 The Committee received a letter from the Postgraduate Dean in Wessex.

28.2 The Committee received a letter from the Postgraduate Dean in the West Midlands.

**29. Any Other Business**

There was no other business to report.

**30. Dates of future meetings**

The committee noted that SAC meetings would be held at The Royal College of Surgeons of England on the following dates (all meetings start at 10:15 unless stated otherwise):

**2013:**

Thursday 19 September

Friday 20 September SAC with TPDs meeting

**Action: Mr Fitzgerald to send an invitation to TPDs for the joint meeting in September and request discussion topics.**

**2014:**

Thursday 23 January

Thursday 5 June

Thursday 18 September

Friday 19 September SAC with TPDs meeting